

多元一体的华人宗教与文化

苏庆华博士花甲纪念论文集

Diversity in Unity: Studies of Chinese Religion & Culture
A Festschrift in Honour of Dr Soo Khin Wah on His Sixtieth Birthday



嚴家建主編



马来亚文化事业有限公司
The Malaya Press Sdn. Bhd.
(3379-P)



版权所有 • 翻印必究

Copyright ©
ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

国际书号 ISBN 978-967-334-882-4

初版 First Printed : 2017年6月

© The Malaya Press Sdn. Bhd.

Hak cipta terpelihara. Tidak dibenarkan mengeluarkan mana-mana bahagian artikel, ilustrasi, dan isi kandungan buku ini dalam apa juga bentuk dan dengan cara apa jua sama ada secara elektronik, fotokopi, mekanik, rakaman, atau cara lain sebelum mendapat izin bertulis daripada The Malaya Press Sdn. Bhd.

多元一体的华人宗教与文化：苏庆华博士花甲纪念论文集

Diversity in Unity: Studies of Chinese Religion & Culture

A Festschrift in Honour of Dr Soo Khin Wah on His Sixtieth Birthday

作者：苏庆华、张珣、陈益源、容世诚、杨妍、李志贤、游子安、危丁明、
严家建、洪莹发、陈耀威、钟大荣、Philip Clart (柯若朴)、陈景熙

主编：严家建

封面与版面设计：郑淑芳

印石篆刻：李荣吉

出版与发行：Publisher and Distributor :

马来亚文化事业有限公司

The Malaya Press Sdn. Bhd. (3379-P)

1, Jln TSB 10, Tmn Perindustrian Sg. Buloh,
47000 Sg. Buloh, Selangor, Malaysia.

Tel: 03-6157 3158 Fax: 03-6157 3957

Website: www.malayapress.com.my

Email: tmp@tmprsb.com

印刷 Printer

GAINS PRINT SDN BHD. (111764-T)

No. 5, Lorong 7/3A, Kawasan Perindustrian Seri Kembangan,
43300 Seri Kembangan, Selangor Darul Ehsan.

Tel: 03-8941 0613 Fax: 03-8941 0621



苏庆华博士近照

(孔万良摄影)

(书中如有缺页、错页或倒装，请联络有关出版单位)



目录

苏庆华博士近照 iii
 苏庆华博士略传 iv
 陈益源教授《序》 vi

第一辑：苏庆华论文

1. 从“吉祥语”和“吉祥图案”透视华人社会的
 择吉文化 1
 2. 集体记忆与身份认同：以槟城大山脚孟兰胜会
 为探讨中心 25
 3. 马六甲王船巡游谱系：以马六甲勇全殿为例 46
 4. 麦长天、麦泰开伯侄与新、马“飞霞”道脉初
 探 78
 5. 马来西亚“肉骨茶”传奇 100

第二辑：师友论文

1. 张珣《“神”抑或“人”？港台天后信仰比较
 初探》 121
 2. 陈益源《人口买卖文件中所见之南洋社会风俗》
 146
 3. 容世诚《“终生”“新月”“大观”：“粤乐
 商家”钱广仁（1898-1980）》 154



4. 杨妍、李志贤《潮人善堂鸾治与中医活动之考
 察：以新加坡修德善堂为例》 176
 5. 游子安《吕祖信仰在省港台的传承——以宏道
 精社与四玄坛为例》 203
 6. 危丁明《香港的佛教复兴与华人传统信仰之重
 心转移》 228
 7. 嚴家建《理性、信仰与天人关系：从孔子的圣
 人形象看儒家的宗教向度》 254
 8. 洪莹发《威震四海：台南、海澄、马六甲代天
 巡狩仪式的观察与思索》 278
 9. 陈耀威《槟城的田都元帅信仰》 317
 10. 钟大荣《一贯道马来西亚宝光建德的宗教教育
 与文化教育》 346
 11. Philip Clart 柯若朴“Han Xiangzu 韩湘子
 in Popular Literature of the Qing Period:
 A Preliminary Investigation of the Hanxian
 baozuan 韩仙宝传” 367
 12. 陈景熙《19世纪中、后期砂拉越古晋潮人社会
 结构初探：以古晋上帝庙为中心》 412
 撰稿者简介 440
 嚴家建《跋》 444
 苏庆华《鸣谢》 446



承自觉行为，而作为更广泛意义上的中华文化海外传播的角度来看，值得重视。⁴ 随着中国综合国力的不断上升，逐渐更加在意海外宗教在内的华人社会文化与其中华文化的关联，2016年4月22日召开的中国全国宗教工作会议上，提出要处理好“中国宗教与外国宗教的关系”、“同宗教界结成统一战线”，在新的时代背景下，中国有关部门应可以更加自信和开放地去思考。

4 根据笔者所了解的情况，除了在宗教朝圣方面，马来西亚宝光建德信众与台湾宝光建德保持密切交流，随着中国大陆改革开放加快、社会进步明显、经济迅速发展，许多马来西亚信众纷纷来大陆经商、学习、旅游等，他们正在建造的最大佛堂——天马道场（位于柔佛州，造价预计2亿马币），许多建筑材料都从广东佛山、福建惠安等地定制。由此可见，马来西亚宝光建德信众对中国大陆整体印象是积极肯定的。



Han Xiangzi 韩湘子 in Popular Literature of the Qing Period: A Preliminary Investigation of the Han xian baozhuan 韩仙宝传

Philip Clart 柯若朴

1. Introduction¹

Han Xiangzi 韩湘子 is best known in popular culture nowadays as one of the “Eight Immortals” (Baxian 八仙), a group that consists of Zhongli Quan 钟离权, Lü Dongbin 吕洞宾, Zhang Guolao 张果老, Li Tieguai 李铁拐, He Xiangtu 何仙姑, Lan Caihe 蓝采和, Cao Guojiu 曹国舅, and Han Xiangzi. These immortals came together as a group by the late Song dynasty

Note: My interest in the Han Xiangzi legends was first awakened during my doctoral studies at the University of British Columbia in the 1990s, where I came to know my *xuexiong* 师兄, Soo Khin Wah 苏庆华, to whom I offer this research article on his sixtieth birthday. An earlier version of this article was presented at the conference on “文学：跨学科之可能,” Guangzhou University, 6 November 2014.

1 This introduction is based on material in my translation of the Ming-period novel *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan* 韩湘子全传, with some updates referring to secondary literature having appeared since its first publication. Of particular importance is Wu Guangzheng's 吴光正 monograph, *Baxian gushi xitong kaolun: neidandao zongjiao shenhua de jian'gou ji qi liubian* 八仙故事系统考论：内丹道宗教神话的建构及其流变 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2006), which had not yet been available to me when I published my translation. Cf. Yang Erzeng, trsl. by Philip Clart, *Han Xiangzi: The Alchemical Adventures of a Daoist Immortal* (Seattle, WA: University of Washington Press, 2007), xv-xxxv.



(twelfth/thirteenth centuries), with only occasional variations in their composition.² Probably the earliest appearance of a Baxian group is found in a wall painting of a Jin dynasty tomb (Taihe 泰和 period, 1201-1209), reflecting a popularity that continued into the Yuan dynasty (1279-1368) with the immortals as motifs on incense burners, clothing, and folk art.³ Dramatists of the Yuan period also got hold of their theme and produced the first literary codifications of their lore. In Yuan drama, the Eight Immortals appear in “deliverance plays” (*dutuoju* 度脱剧), which focus usually on only a few of the group, most prominently Zhongli Qian and Lü Dongbin.⁴ By the Ming dynasty (1368-1644), the Eight Immortals had come to occupy a firm place in the dramatic repertoire, both in the form of full-length plays⁵ and in short skits performed on auspicious occasions such as birthdays (*Baxian qingshou*

- 2 Wang Hanmin 王汉民, *Baxian yu Zhongguo wenhua* 八仙与中国文化 (Beijing: Zhongguo shehui kexue chubanshe, 2000), 36.
- 3 Wang Hanmin, *Baxian yu Zhongguo wenhua*, 37. For the development of the Baxian motif in Yuan period pictorial art, see Anning Jing, “The Eight Immortals: The Transformation of T’ang and Sung Taoist Eccentrics During the Yüan Dynasty,” in *Arts of the Sung and Yüan*. ed. Maxwell K. Hearn & Judith G. Smith (New York: The Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1996), 213-229.
- 4 An example is the play *Han Zhongli dutuo Lan Caihe* 汉钟离度脱蓝采和 (“Zhongli of the Han delivers Lan Caihe”), which has been translated by Wilt Idema and Stephen H. West. See their *Chinese Theater 1100-1450: A Source Book* (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1982), 299-343. See *ibidem* for an analysis of the thematic structure of deliverance plays.



八仙庆寿).⁶ Especially the latter remain a fixture in local opera traditions across China. The Ming period also saw the first full narrative development of the Eight Immortals complex in the form of a novel, the *Dongyou ji* 东游记 (“Journey to the East”) by Wu Yuantai 吴元泰.⁷ Much of the later Eight Immortals lore is linked with this important text, including the famous story of their crossing of the ocean (*Baxian guohai* 八仙过海), which became a staple motif in folk art and can still be found today painted on many Taiwanese temple walls and stitched on bright red cloths (*baxiancai* 八仙彩) that are hung over entrances to bring blessings to the building and its inhabitants⁸. Thus, since the Ming dynasty the Eight Immortals have found a firm place in Chinese popular culture, their stories transmitted through the theatre, folk art, story-

- 5 One of the best known examples is Tang Xianzu’s 汤显祖 Lü Dongbin play *Handan ji* 邯郸记. Wu Xiuhua 吴秀华, *Tang Xianzu Handan meng ji jiaozhu* 汤显祖《邯郸梦记》校注 (Shijiazhuang: Hebei jiaoyu chubanshe, 2004).
- 6 On the place of the Baxian in traditional opera, see Idema & West, *Chinese Theater 1100-1450*, 300-308; Wang Hanmin, *Baxian yu Zhongguo wenhua*, chapter 5. Also, Chen Lingling 陈玲玲, “Baxian zai Yuan-Ming zaju he Taiwan banxianxi zhong de zhuangkuang 八仙在元明杂剧和台湾扮仙戏中的状况” (M.A. thesis, Wenhua Xueyuan, 1978).
- 7 Numerous editions exist. See for example, *Si youji* 四游记, comp. by Wang Jiquan 王继权 (Harbin: Beifang wenzue chubanshe, 1985). Trsl. by Nadine Perront, *Pérégrination vers l’est* (Paris: Gallimard, 1993).
- 8 On the *baxiancai*, see Wang Jingyi’s 王静苾 *Shenling huoxian: jingyan baxiancai* 神灵活现: 惊艳八仙彩 (Luzhou shi: Boyang wenhua, 2000). The story of the Baxian’s crossing of the ocean appears first in the



Baxian group. In this paper I will continue my exploration of the story cycle surrounding Han Xiangzi, which so far has produced an English translation of a late Ming novel, the *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan* 韩湘子全传, a journal article, and a forthcoming essay on a Ming period Han Xiangzi drama.¹²

Han Xiangzi is said to be a nephew or grandnephew of the famous Tang dynasty Confucian scholar Han Yu 韩愈 (768-824). And indeed there are reliable indications that Han Yu did have a relative named Han Xiang. He was a son of Han Yu's nephew Han Laocheng 韩老成. In 819 Han Xiang and his brother Han Pang 韩滂 followed Han Yu into his exile to

11 Che Xilun 车锡伦 lists six Baxian *baojuan* in his bibliography *Zhongguo baojuan zongmu* 中国宝卷总目 (Taipei: Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Zhongguo wenzhe yanjiusuo choubelichu, 1998), 1-2. A fairly easily accessible one of these is the *Baxian da shangshou baojuan* 八仙大上寿宝卷 ("Precious volume on the Eight Immortals' birth congratulations"), which is included in the collection *Baojuan chuji* 宝卷初集, ed. by Zhang Xishun 张希舜 et al., vol.28 (Taiyuan: Shanxi renmin chubanshe, no date). An overview of Baxian motifs in folk art and folk literature can be found in Wang Hanmin, *Baxian yu Zhongguo wenhua*, chapter 4. See also Shan Man 山曼, *Baxian chuanshuo yu xinyang* 八仙传说与信仰 (Beijing: Xueyuan chubanshe, 2003).

12 Yang/Clart, *The Story of Han Xiangzi*; Clart, "The Relationship of Myth and Cult in Chinese Popular Religion: Some Remarks on Han Xiangzi," *Xingda zhongwen xuebao* 兴大中文学报 23 (2008): 479-513 (Supplementary issue, zengkan 增刊); "Intertextual Relationships between Ming Period Dramas and Novels: Two Examples from the Han Xiangzi Narrative Complex," paper presented at the conference 宗教实践与文学创作暨《中国宗教文学史》编撰国际学术研讨会, Foguangshan 佛光山 (Kaohsiung, Taiwan), January 9-15, 2014 (to be published in the conference proceedings volume).

telling⁹, novels¹⁰, and popular literature (such as "precious volumes", *baojuan* 宝卷).¹¹

In a similar sequence of genres we also have separate narrative traditions focusing on individual members of the

Yuan drama "Zheng yuban Baxian guo canghai" 争玉板八仙过沧海 ("Struggling over jade clappers, the Eight Immortals cross the vast ocean"). On this play see Chen Lingling, "Baxian zai Yuan-Ming zaju", 35-36. Paul R. Katz describes a Yuan dynasty mural with the *Baxian guohai* motif at the Yongle Gong 永乐宫 in Shanxi. See his *Images of the Immortal: The Cult of Lü Dongbin at the Palace of Eternal Joy* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999), 188-189. A modern example of a Baxian temple mural is described in Zeng Qinliang's 曾勤良 *Sanxia Zushi Miao diaohui gushi tanyuan* 三峡祖师庙雕绘故事探源 (Taipei: Wenjin, 1996), 302-304.

- 9 Three recent collections of Baxian stories collected in different parts of the Chinese mainland are: *Baxian chuanshuo gushi ji* 八仙传说故事集, ed. Yu Hang 俞航 (Beijing: Zhongguo minjian wenyi chubanshe, 1988); *Baxian renwu de chuanshuo* 八仙人物的传说, ed. Liu Xicheng 刘锡诚. Xiao Rong 萧蓉, and Feng Zhi 逢之 (Shijiazhuang: Huashan wenyi chubanshe, 1995); and *Baxian de gushi* 八仙的故事, ed. Chen Delai 陈德来 & Liu Xunda 刘巽达 (Taipei: Jiangmen wenwu, 1995). There is considerable overlap between the books by Yu Hang and Liu Xicheng et al. Yu Hang's book has also been republished in Taiwan by a certain Ouyang Jingyi 欧阳晶宜 as *Baxian chuanqi* 八仙传奇 (Banqiao: Kezhu shuju, 1992) and *Baxian de gushi* 八仙的故事 (Banqiao: Kezhu shuju, 1995).
- 10 In the 19th century, there appeared the novel *Baxian dedao* 八仙得道 ("The Eight Immortals Attain the Dao") by Wugou Daoren 无垢道人 (Shenyang: Chunfeng wenyi chubanshe, 1987). A modern example is Chen Sanfeng's 陈三峰 *Baxian chuanqi* 八仙传奇 (Xinzhuan: Mantingfang, 1994). An overview of Baxian-related novels is given in Han Xiduo's 韩锡铎 *Baxian xilie xiaoshuo* 八仙系列小说 (Shenyang: Liaoning jiaoyu chubanshe, 1993).



Chaozhou 潮州, where he had been banished for criticizing the emperor's worship of a Buddha relic. In 820, Han Xiang followed his great-uncle to a new post in Yuanzhou 袁州, where his brother Han Pang died at the age of 19. According to the historical records, Han Xiang was born in 793 and passed the *jinshi* examination in 823, that is, when he was thirty years of age. His *zi* was Beizhu 北渚 and his highest official appointment was assistant minister in the Court of Judicial Review. His death date is unclear. The *Complete Poems of the Tang Dynasty* (*Quan Tang shi* 《全唐诗》) contains a handful of poems addressed to Han Xiang by various authors. The most famous of these is the one that is immediately connected with the appearance of the Han Xiangzi legend. It is Han Yu's poem composed in 819 at the Blue Pass 蓝关 on his way to his exile in Chaozhou (modern Guangdong province):

《左迁至蓝关示姪孙湘》

一封朝奏九重天
夕贬潮州路八千
欲为圣明除弊事
肯将衰朽惜残年
云横秦岭家何在
雪拥蓝关马不前
知汝远来应有意
好收吾骨瘴江边¹³

"Demoted I arrive at Lan-t'ien Pass and Show This Poem to My Brother's Grandson Han Hsiang"

A sealed epistle submitted
at dawn to Nine-fold Heaven—
Exiled at dusk to Ch'ao-chou
eight thousand leagues to travel

Wishing to save his Sagacious
Brilliance
from treacherous evils,
could I have cared for the years that
remain
in my withered limbs?

Clouds straddle the mountains of
Ch'in
where is my house?
snows crowd the pass at L an
horses will not move.

I know what the reason must be
that makes you come so far—
the better to gather my bones
from shores of miasmatic water.¹⁴

The poem expresses Han Yu's relief on seeing his nephew

13 Chen Keming 陈克明, *Han Yu nianpu ji shiwen xinian* 韩愈年谱及诗文系年 (Chengdu: Bashu shushe, 1999), 526; Qian Zhonglian 钱仲联, *Han Changli shi xinian jishi* 韩昌黎诗系年集释 (Taipei: Xuehai chubanshe, 1985), 1097.

14 Charles Hartman, *Han Yü and the T'ang Search for Unity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1986), 86-87. Cf. Erwin von Zach's German translation in his *Han Yü's poetische Werke* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1952), 276-277.



arrive amidst the heavy snow at the Blue Pass in the Qin mountain range south of Chang'an. Nothing in the sparse existing biographical data on Han Xiang indicates any deeper meaning, yet this poem was to become central in the evolving Han Xiangzi lore. It was taken to refer to Han Xiangzi's arrival at Han Yu's side to rescue him by means of his supernatural powers, and to deliver him from his worldly delusions and allow him to become an immortal.

In terms of historical sources there is of course a serious problem. The historical Han Xiang seems to have led a fairly conventional life, enjoyed a moderately successful official career, and apparently had no particular Daoist leanings. So what does he have to do with the Daoist immortal who delivers Han Yu at Blue Pass? Well, possibly he was conflated with another relative of Han Yu's who indeed is said to have possessed magical abilities. Among Han Yu's writings we find a poem (dating to the year 799) in which he records the visit of a distant relative who claimed to possess extraordinary skills. The relevant passages are found in verses 15 through 22:

《赠族侄》

[...]

击门者谁子
 问言乃吾宗
 自云有奇术
 探妙知天工
 既往怅何及
 将来喜还通
 期我语非佞
 当为佐时雍¹⁵

"Presented to a Distant Nephew"

[...]

Who is that knocks on the door?
 To my inquiry he replies that he is of
 my clan.
 He claims to possess magical powers,
 That he has investigated the marvels
 of the cosmos and understands the
 workings of Heaven.
 It is of no use to regret the past,
 But I will be glad to have success in
 the future.
 If indeed yours are not just artful
 words,
 I should become a man who is useful
 to his times.¹⁶

Han Yu thus receives a visitor who claims to be of his lineage, obviously of a lower generation than Han Yu, as the latter addresses him in the poem's title as a "distant nephew" (*zuzhi*, a nephew in a generalized sense as a distant relative of a

15 Chen Keming, *Han Yu nianpu ji shiwen xinian*, 92; Qian Zhonglian, *Han Changli shi xinian jishi*, 98.

16 Cf. von Zach's translation, *Han Yü's poetische Werke*, 294-295.





poem of 819. The nephew then declares his unwillingness to enter officialdom and leaves. The nephew is not named, but the story of the verses appearing on the flower petals becomes a part of later Han Xiangzi lore.

Through the Five Dynasties and early Song period we find more stories (in the anecdotal literature and also in Daoist hagiography) about the mysterious nephew of Han Yu, whose magical powers grow over time. The earliest explicit linking of the themes in the two poems appears in Du Guangting's 杜光庭 (850-933) *Xianzhuan shiyi* 仙传拾遗 where the nephew prepares the peonies and leaves. Han Yu is banished and encounters the same nephew at Blue Pass. The next spring the peonies open and are found to be inscribed with the two verses. Here for the first time it is also claimed that the nephew later transmitted the Dao to Han Yu.¹⁸ This version contains an implicit identification of the nephew with Han Xiang (though problematically the nephew here is called a *waisheng* 外甥, i.e., a nephew through a female member of Han Yu's lineage, which does not fit Han Xiang's profile—but again historical exactitude is not the first concern here). The first time this identification is made explicit is in Liu Fu's 刘斧 (ca. 1040-later than 1113) *Qingsuo gaoyi* 青琐高议.¹⁹

18 Quoted under the title "Han Yu waisheng 韩愈外甥" in *Taiping guangji* 太平广记, *juan* 54 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1986), 331.

19 *Qingsuo gaoyi*, *qianji*, *juan* 9 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1983), 85-87.



younger generation). The visitor claims to have magical skills and to be able to predict the future. Han Yu himself was thirty-two at the time of this event.

These two poems, one mentioning the visit of a supernaturally gifted "distant nephew" in 799, the other of Han Yu's encounter with his grandnephew Han Xiang at Blue Pass twenty years later together are the starting point for the Han Xiangzi legend. Its core features are Han Xiangzi's prediction of Han Yu's predicament at Blue Pass and his rescue of Han Yu when the prediction comes true. Chronologically it is impossible for Han Xiang to be the "distant nephew" mentioned in the 799 poem (he would have been about six years of age at the time), but attention to detail is not a great concern of myth-makers. And so very early on we find tales about an unusually gifted nephew of Han Yu. The first instance occurred in a text composed by a near-contemporary of Han Yu and Han Xiang, Duan Chengshi's 段成式 (803-863) *Youyang zazu* 酉阳杂俎.¹⁷ He records that a distant nephew of Han Yu was taken into his household and given an education. The nephew however turns out to be unruly and unwilling to study. When Han Yu confronts him, the nephew claims to have other skills, namely to grow multi-coloured peonies. He prepares such a plant for Han Yu and when after several weeks it blossoms, on its petals are inscribed the fifth and sixth verses of Han Yu's

17 *Youyang zazu*, *qianji*, *juan* 18 (Taipei: Taiwan xuesheng shuju, 1975), 104. On the *Youyang zazu* see Carrie E. Reed, *A Tang Miscellany: An Introduction to Youyang zazu* (New York: Peter Lang, 2003).

From then on, the core of Han Xiangzi lore is established: Han Xiangzi as an unconventional and Daoist-leaning nephew who by means of a magical flower trick predicts Han Yu's banishment, saves him in his predicament at Blue Pass, and later transmits the Dao to him. Later sources elaborate on that core and add additional elements such as Han Xiangzi's earlier existence as a numinous white crane, his apprenticeship with Zhongli Quan and Lü Dongbin, his unconsummated marriage, and his later deliverance of his wife and his aunt. Some or all of these themes came together in Yuan drama, where we find four pieces specifically devoted to Han Xiangzi, of which none has survived.²⁰ The earliest surviving texts with a fairly elaborate development of the Han Xiangzi theme (as separate from the Baxian lore) are:

- a novella called *Han xian zhuan* 韩仙传 which may date somewhere between the late Yuan and middle Ming periods;²¹

20 Wilt L. Idema has tried to reconstruct the plots of some lost Han Xiangzi dramas. "Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*," *Daoism: Religion, History and Society*, no. 8 (2016): 111-115.

21 Two editions of the *Han xian zhuan* survive. One dates from the turn of seventeenth century and is part of a Ming dynasty collection by the name of *Baoyan tang miji* 宝颜堂秘笈 ("Secret Bookbox of Baoyan Hall"), a very mixed collection of 226 works in 457 *juan*, which share the quality of having been estimated "rare texts" by their editor. This editor is *Chen Jiru* 陈继儒 (1558-1639), a somewhat eccentric and reclusive private scholar with interests in all fields of literature. On Chen Jiru see Jamie Greenbaum, *Chen Jiru (1558-1639): The Background to Development and Subsequent Uses of Literary Personae* (Leiden: Brill, 2007).

- a Ming period drama (*Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong shengxian ji* 韩湘子九度文公升仙记).²²

This development of Han Xiangzi lore finds its culmination in the late Ming novel *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan* 韩湘子全传, which was authored by Yang Erzeng 杨尔曾, a Hangzhou writer and book-seller/publisher active in the early seventeenth century.²³ The earliest surviving edition dates to 1623.²⁴ The storyline begins in the Han dynasty where Han Xiangzi's previous incarnation is a beautiful, but haughty woman, who is consequently reborn as a white crane. The crane cultivates itself and meets Zhongli Quan and Lü Dongbin. They deliver it to be reborn as the son of Han Yu's elder brother Han Hui 韩会.²³ After Han Hui's and his wife's death Han Xiangzi

The Baoyan Tang miji version can be found in *Baibu congshu jicheng zhi shiba* 百部丛书集成之十八, vol. 65 (Taipei: Yiwen yinshuguan, 1965). A reprint of the same edition is included in *Zangwai daoshu* 藏外道书, ed. by Hu Daojing 胡道静 et al., vol. 18 (Chengdu: Bashu shushe, 1992-1994), 802-814. The second edition is located in the *Shuofu* 说乎 compiled by Tao Zongyi 陶宗仪 (1316-1403), which would give us a date *ante quem* in the Yuan dynasty. However, the only *Shuofu* edition to contain the *Han xian zhuan* is the somewhat dubious 120 *juan* version edited by Tao Ting 陶珉 of the early Qing period. Therefore, the only thing we know for sure right now is that the text was in existence by the end of the 16th century, when Chen Jiru was compiling his collection. For an English translation of the *Han xian zhuan*, see my "The Story of the Immortal Han (*Han xian zhuan*): An Annotated Translation" (MS, 1992). A modern Chinese rendering of the text can be found in *Baixian chuanqi* 百仙传奇, ed. by Yuan Lükun 袁闾琨 (Zhonghe: Jianhong chubanshe, 1995), 437-462.

22 In *Guben xiqu congkan chuji* 古本戏曲丛刊初集, vol. 47 (Shanghai: Shangwu yinshuguan, 1954).





is raised in Han Yu's household where he is treated like a son (as he is the only male offspring of the Han family). Han Yu has great expectations of Han Xiangzi, but the latter follows his karmic destiny and runs away from home to join his masters Zhongli Quan and Lü Dongbin in the mountains. There he cultivates inner alchemy and becomes an immortal. The Jade Emperor sends him back to earth to deliver his uncle Han Yu, his aunt, and his wife Luying 芦英. After many failed attempts to break down Han Yu's Confucian obstinacy he delivers him at Blue Pass and later does the same for his aunt and wife. The story has a strong anti-Confucian element and was clearly written by an author knowledgeable in matters of internal alchemy. The prose narrative alternates with an unusually large number of poetic passages, many of which give rather profound summaries of alchemical wisdom. So this is certainly a didactic novel in that it teaches the superiority of Daoism over Confucianism and gives quite practical lessons in internal alchemy.

The preface to the Han Xiangzi quanzhuan ²⁴ claims that the novel was based on crude storytellers' versions, which Yang Erzeng subjected to literary refinement:

24 Jinling 金陵: Jiuru Tang 九如堂, 1623 (Van Gulik collection microfiche CH-1289). Another edition from the Tianqi reign period entitled simply *Han Xiangzi* survives in the Naikaku Bunko and is reproduced in Liu Shide 刘世德 et al. eds., *Guben xiaoshuo congkan* 古本小说丛刊, series 34, vol. 4 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1991). Also in *Guben xiaoshuo jicheng* 古本小说集成, vol. 200:1/2 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, no date).



- 23 See my translation of the *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan: The Story of Han Xiangzi*. Aside from the Han Xiangzi quanzhuan, Yang Erzeng has been involved to differing degrees in the editing of at least six other works that still survive today: (1) the *Hainei qiguan* 海内奇观, an "armchair traveller's" collection of maps and illustrations of famous mountains and temples (In *Zhongguo gudai banhua congkan er bian* (di 8 ji) 中国古代版画丛刊二编 (第八辑), Shanghai: Shanghai guji chubanshe, 1994); (2) the *Xianyuan jishi* 仙媛纪事, a collection of hagiographies of female immortals (Taipei: Taiwan xuesheng shuju, 1989); (3) the *Dongxi Jin yanyi* 东西晋演义, a historical novel (Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushuguan, 1971); (4) the *Su Dongpo xiansheng chanxi ji* 苏东坡先生禅喜集, a collection of Buddhist-inspired poetry of Su Shi, compiled by Chen Jiru 陈继儒 (Ming edition from the Wanli period held at the Fu Ssu-nien Library, Academia Sinica); (5) the *Xu Zhenjun jingming zongjiao lu* 许真君净明宗教录, a collection of texts by and on the immortal Xu Xun 许逊 (1604 Zhan shi Xiqing Tang edition at the library of Beijing Daxue); (6) the *Tuhui zongyi* 图绘宗彝, an anthology of reproduced paintings (Wulin 武林: Yibai Tang 夷白堂, 1607). Of particular interest is Yang Erzeng's involvement as collator in Chen Jiru's collection of Chan poems by Su Shi. The reader may remember that Chen Jiru included the *Han xian zhuan* in his anthology *Baoyan Tang miji* (see above footnote 39). If it could be shown that Chen and Yang Erzeng were acquainted, this could explain how Yang came across the topic of Han Xiangzi, namely, through a suggestion from Chen or by borrowing Chen's copy of the *Han xian zhuan*. However, this is just a wild guess right now and needs further study. On the textual history of this collection, see Beata Grant, *Mount Lu Revisited: Buddhism in the Life and Writings of Su Shih* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1994), 3. Also see Greenbaum, *Chen Jiru (1558-1639)*, 72. For further studies of Yang Erzeng and his works, see Lin Li-chiang 林丽江, "A Study of the *Xinjuan hainei qiguan*, a Ming Dynasty Book of Famous Sites," in *Bridges to Heaven: Essays on East Asian Art in Honor of Professor Wen C. Fong*, ed. Jerome Silbergeld, Dora C.Y. Ching, Judith G. Smith, and Alfreda Murck (Princeton: P.Y. and Kinmay W. Tang Center for East Asian Art, Princeton University in association with Princeton University Press, 2011), 779-812; Kung Man 龚敏, "Mingdai chubanjia Yang Erzeng bianzhuan kanke kao 明代出版家杨尔曾编撰刊刻考," *Wenxue xinyao* 文学新钥 10 (2009): 195-230.



只以朦瞽瞽叟，执筒高歌；道扮狂诞，一唱三叹。熙熙然谦愚氓村妪之心，洋洋乎入学究蒙童之耳，而章法庞杂舛错，谚词诘屈聱牙。以之当榜客鼓柁之歌，虽听者忘疲；以之登骚卿鉴赏之坛，则观者闭目。今之传湘子者，岂有得於神气之奥，因驾长年之永辙，而托湘子以宣泄其梗概耶？抑果有是湘子而借其事以吐胸中之奇耶？仿模外史，引用方言，编辑成书，扬榷故实。阅历疏窗，三载搜罗。传往迹，标分残帙，如于目次；布新编，文章奇诡，笔从意宏。识记博洽，锋毫藻振。

This statement of the novel's preface makes it clear that Yang Erzeng reworked his plot from other, more popular texts and local traditions, but we are not all certain what these texts were. A possibility is the play *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong shengxianji*, some of whose arias re-appear in slightly modified in the novel; significantly, the modifications applied by Yang Erzeng often are exactly of the "refining" type alluded to in the preface. The play was published in the early Wanli 万历 period (between 1572 and 1588) in modern-day Nanjing and therefore definitely predates the novel.²⁶ However, whether Yang Erzeng drew directly from the play's libretto or whether

25 Yang/Clart, *The Story of Han Xiangzi*, 4-5.

26 Ma Huaxiang 马华祥, "Wanli Jinling Fuchuntang kanben chuanqi banben kao 万历金陵富春堂刊本传奇版本考," *Huaqiao Daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 华侨大学学报 (哲学社会科学版) 2010, no. 4: 99. See also Cheng Hong 程洪, "Das Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong shengxianji: Literatur- und geistesgeschichtliche Analyse eines Ming-zeitlichen Dramas," MA thesis, University of Leipzig, 2012; Idema, "Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*," 115-120.



His story is only transmitted by the blind storytellers who either sing in a loud voice while holding documents like officials, or recite ballads in a wild manner dressed up as Daoist priests, sighing three times for every line they chant. These stories everywhere delight the hearts of ignorant people and village matrons, and are listened to by school teachers and their pupils. Yet their style is disorderly and erroneous, their poems are inept and awkward. If they are sung by boatmen while rowing their oars, those who listen will forget their fatigue. But if one were to ascend with them the stage of poetic appreciation, the audience would close their eyes in embarrassment.

As for those who nowadays transmit the story of Xiangzi, could there be one who, having a grasp of the marvels of pneuma ingestion, has thereby succeeded in lengthening his years, and who uses the figure of Xiangzi to divulge the general outline of such successful practice? Or, if this Xiangzi really exists, is there one who might use his story to express the wondrous insights of his own mind? Imitating romances and drawing on local traditions, such a writer compiled this book, telling the story in its general outlines. Having only limited experience, he spent three years pursuing Xiangzi's traces. He marked and divided his manuscript into chapters and published it as an original work. Its style is extraordinary, being written with a liberal brush and broadminded intentions. Its contents have both breadth and depth, being composed with a powerful pen in elegant diction.²⁵



his novel and the play were both based on a third source cannot be finally decided at this point.²⁷ Wang Yun 王芸 has argued that both the novel and the play were in fact based on one or more *daoqing*.²⁸ This argument has been augmented recently by Wilt L. Idema who claims to have discovered a Ming period *daoqing* that “served as one of the major sources of the early 17th-century novel Han Xiangzi quanzhuan”: *Han Xiangzi's Twelffold Conversion of Han Yu: Indigo Pass (Han Xiangzi shi'erdu Han Wengong Languan ji 韩湘子十二度韩文公蓝关记)*.²⁹ This is certainly an intriguing hypothesis, but in my view Idema's Ming dating of the edition held in the Library of the Institute of Oriental Culture of the University of Tokyo is far from certain at this point.³⁰ Even if it were a Ming text, we would still need further confirmation by a detailed intertextual comparison before we can accept this text as an actual precursor of Yang Erzeng's novel.³¹

27 For more on the relationship of novel and play, see Clart, “Intertextual Relationships between Ming Period Dramas and Novels: Two Examples from the Han Xiangzi Narrative Complex.”

28 Wang Yun 王芸, “Han Xiangzi quanzhuan yu daoqing 《韩湘子全传》与道情,” *Zhongguo Daojiao* 中国道教 2009, no.1: 52-55.

29 Wilt L. Idema, “Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*,” 95.

30 See Idema's arguments for a Ming dating of the text: Idema, “Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*,” 107.

31 A quick scan of the *Han Xiangzi shi'erdu Han Wengong Languan ji* did not yield any immediate and clear textual connections with the novel, but any more definite evaluation requires a careful textual study that cannot be provided here and now. See http://shanben.ioc.u-tokyo.ac.jp/main_p.php?nu=D8500800&order=rn_no&no=01918 (last accessed on April 29, 2017).

In the following Qing period we find the Han Xiangzi theme being taken up in various forms of popular literature: *baojuan*,³² *tanci*, *dagushu*,³³ *daoqing*,³⁴ local theatre.³⁵ The focus remains on the theme of deliverance, though in the popular texts attention often shifts from the deliverance of Han Yu to that of his wife Luying, or Lin Ying 林英 as she is

32 Che Xilun lists nine Han Xiangzi *baojuan* (*Zhongguo baojuan zongmu*, 101-102, 159, 203), though it is not clear whether these are really nine independent texts or whether some represent mere title variations. A broader overview of Han Xiangzi-related popular literature is provided by Wu Guangzheng, *Baxian gushi xitong kaolun*, chapter 13.

During a recent stay in Beijing (February and March 2017) I collected a significant number of late Qing, Republican, and early PRC period texts (among them *baojuan*, *daoqing*, and ballads) which still await careful comparison; these will be introduced in a forthcoming publication.

33 Chen Liyu discusses various ballads on the Han Xiangzi theme on pp. 131-162 of her thesis. Chen Liyu 陈丽宇, “Han Xiangzi yanjiu 韩湘子研究,” M.A. thesis, Taiwan Shifan Daxue, 1988.

34 Zhang Yanli 张燕丽, “Qing zhongwanqi Jinbei daoqing jumu yanjiu 清中晚期晋北道情剧目研究,” *Shanxi Daxue xuebao (zhexue shehui kexue ban)* 山西大学学报 (哲学社会科学版) 37, no. 4 (2014): 141-144; Zhang Zehong 张泽洪, “Ming-Qing yilai Daojiao chang daoqing zai Hubei de chuanbo 明清以来道教唱道情在湖北的传播,” *Wuhan Daxue xuebao (renwen kexue ban)* 武汉大学学报 (人文科学版) 63, no. 5 (2010): 567-573; Wang Dingyong 王定勇, *Jiangsu daoqing kaolun* 江苏道情考论 (Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe, 2013), 82-89.

35 An overview of Han Xiangzi pieces in local opera traditions is given by Chen Liyu, “Han Xiangzi yanjiu,” 114-120. A Taiwan opera on Han Xiangzi's deliverance of his wife (“Du qi” 渡妻) is included in *Taiwan suo jian de beiguan shouchaoben* 台湾所见的北管手抄本, ed. Chen Xiufang 陈秀芳, vol. 3 (Taichung: Taiwan sheng wenxian weiyuanhui, 1981), 204-213.



2. The *Han xian baozhuan*

After my work on surviving Ming dynasty Han Xiangzi texts, the present paper opens the next phase of my research project by beginning to explore the Han Xiangzi storyline in Qing dynasty popular literature. The focus will be on a nineteenth-century *baojuan* called variously *Han Xiangzi baozhuan* 韩湘子宝传, *Han xian baozhuan* 韩仙宝传, *Han xian baojian* 韩仙宝鉴, *Han xian zhuan* 韩仙传, or *Baihe zhuan* 白鹤传; I will refer to it by its arguably most common title, *Han xian baozhuan* (hereafter: HXBZ). I will here examine it with regard to its plot structure in comparison to that of the Ming-dynasty novel, *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan* (hereafter: HXZQZ). The point here is not to treat the HXBZ as a popularization of HXZQZ. Scholars are quite unanimous that few Qing dynasty works of popular literature are based directly on HXZQZ; instead they probably stand in the earlier *daoqing* tradition, on which the HXZQZ itself had drawn. However, a side by side comparison of the two texts will reveal plot differences that in my view are not accidental, but can be related to the texts' respective genres and target audiences.³⁸

38 An exception is an 18-chapter *baojuan* titled *Han Xiang baojuan*, which does indeed depend directly on the HXZQZ. See Idema, "Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*," 123, citing a 2015 article by Bian Liangjun 卞良君.



usually called in the popular genres. Given the large female component in the audience for this literature, such a shift is understandable. There exists a significant enough number of such popular works to show that Han Xiangzi remained a well-known figure through the Qing period. In Ye County 掖县 of Shandong province there even developed a specific local ballad genre based on the Han Xiangzi story (the Blue Pass Drama, *Languan xi* 蓝关戏).³⁶ Among the Eight Immortals, he is perhaps second only to Lü Dongbin in the number of surviving texts devoted to him as an individual, rather than as one of the Baxian.³⁷

36 Wang Hanmin, *Baxian yu Zhongguo wenhua*, 109. See also Wu Yimin 武艺民, *Zhongguo daoqing yishu gailun* 中国道情艺术概论 (Taiyuan: Shanxi guji chubanshe, 1997), 135 et passim. Sun Shougang 孙守刚, *Languanxi* 蓝关戏 (Ji'nan: Shandong youyi chubanshe, 2012).

37 For a more detailed description of the literary tradition of the Han Xiangzi story, see the "Introduction" to my translation of the late Ming dynasty novel *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan*. Another member of the Baxian with a separate narrative tradition is He Xiang, who has a number of *baojuan* to her name and appears occasionally as an independent deity in Taiwanese popular religion. In fact, from my experience among Taiwanese spirit-writing cults, she is perhaps a better-known figure nowadays than Han Xiangzi, even though her role in Late Imperial literature is less significant than that of Han Xiangzi. On the narrative traditions pertaining to He Xiang, see Wu Guangzheng, *Baxian gushi xitong kaolun*, chapter 11.



I am working from four editions:

- 1) Han xian baozhuan, 1882 woodblock print, Pushi 浦市 (Hunan), Waseda University digital file “bunko19_f0399_0054.pdf” downloaded at http://www.wul.waseda.ac.jp/kotenseki/html/bunko19/bunko19_f0399_0054/index.html (last accessed May 26, 2017).
- 2) Baihe zhuan, 1883 woodblock print, Guangxizhou 广西州.
- 3) Han Xiangzi baozhuan (Han xian zhuan), Taichung: Shengxiantang 圣贤堂, no date (1970/80s?).
- 4) Baihe baozhuan 白鹤宝传, photocopied and thread-bound undated manuscript copy (post Cultural Revolution?).³⁹

The editions only have minor textual differences. As for the geographical origins of this text, the only clear reference to time and place that we have is the preface by Fuyou Dijun 孚佑帝君 produced by spirit-writing on September 17, 1872 at the Ganlin shuguan in the Wenchangong in Qiannan 黔南文昌宫内甘霖书馆 (present-day Guizhou province). This preface, however, only provides an endorsement of the *baojuan* presented by a follower of the Wenchangong spirit-writing cult. A colophon defines the author as a certain Layman of South Mountain 南山居士 who wrote the text probably in 1872 at the Library of Accumulated Goodness

39 Additional online editions can be viewed at <http://wenku.baidu.com/view/492a2ffff705cc17552709fe.html>; <http://www.taolibrary.com/category/category11/c1118.htm>.



积善书馆, whose location, however, is not known. Since the date of the colophon is likely the same as that of the preface and the location given is also a “shuguan,” we may speculate that the author was affiliated with another spirit-writing cult in the Guizhou area.

The text is divided into twelve chapters (*hui* 回). The following is a synopsis of the main story line as it evolves in these chapters, including a comparison with parallel elements in the late Ming novel *Han Xiangzi quanzhuan*:

Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>Heavenly existence of HXZ (as a White Crane 白鹤) and Lin Ying 林英 (as an Immortal Reed 仙芦). Both punished for worldly thoughts (<i>sifan</i> 思凡), including for each other, by being reborn in the human world with the fate to be married to each other. HXZ as son of Han Xiu 韩休 and Mrs. Lü 吕氏; Lin Ying as daughter of Lin Guo 林国.</p>	<p>Chapter 1: Pre-incarnational story of HXZ different: also a white crane, but no establishment of affinity with his future wife; instead relationship with a musk deer, whose deliverance is one of the final tasks of HXZ.</p> <p>Chapter 2: Rebirth as son of Han Hui 韩会 and his wife, Mrs. Zheng 郑.</p>





Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>HXZ does not speak before the age of three <i>sui</i>. Han Xiu passes away soon afterwards; HXZ is raised by his uncle Han Yu 韩愈 and aunt Mrs. Du 杜氏. HXZ's mother Mrs. Lü passes away when he is seven <i>sui</i>. Han Yu hires two teachers for HXZ: Zhongli Quan 钟离权 and Lü Yan 吕严, whom he meets on Saijin Bridge 赛金桥. They teach HXZ at a place called Wohushan 卧虎山; they offer him the options of immortality or worldly success; HXZ chooses the former and vows to deliver his parents once he has become an immortal.</p>	<p>HXZ does not speak before the age of three <i>sui</i>. Han Hui passes away soon afterwards.</p> <p>Chapter 3: HXZ's mother dies when HXZ is seven years old. Han Yu and his wife Mrs. Dou 窦氏 raise him.</p> <p>Chapter 4: Han Yu hires two teachers for HXZ: Zhongli Quan 钟离权 and Lü Yan 吕严, whom he meets on Saijin Bridge 赛金桥. They teach HXZ at a place called Shuihushan 睡虎山; they offer him the options of immortality or worldly success; HXZ chooses the former. Han Yu expels the two teachers.</p>

Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>Han Yu and Lin Guo, assisted by the official Li Hedong 李河东 as matchmaker, agree to have HXZ and Lin Ying marry each other when they are of age. Six years pass, HXZ turns thirteen <i>sui</i> and preparations for the wedding get under way. The wife of Lin Guo sends out two servants (Lin An 林安 & Lin Fu 林富) to find a carpenter who will make Lin Ying's trousseau chest & furniture. The divine carpenter Lu Ban 鲁班 materializes and produces an exquisite trousseau set, rich in symbolic meaning. On the wedding day, Han Yu sends Zhang Qian 张千</p>	<p>Betrothal and marriage with Lin Luying 林卢英, daughter of Lin Gui 林圭, dealt with in chapter 3. HXZ refuses to consummate the marriage.</p>





and Li Wan 李万 to Wohushan to fetch HXZ; arriving there they witness HXZ and his teachers singing *daoqing* rather than studying the Classics. As HXZ and Lin Ying see each other at the wedding feast for the first time, HXZ remained unmoved, while Lin Ying is immediately enchanted by the bridegroom. In the bridal chamber HXZ vows to keep his purity and meditates instead of consummating the marriage. He eventually moves to a separate chamber. Lengthy dialogue and exchange of poems between HXZ and Lin Ying.



Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>One year has passed since the wedding. Lin Ying leaves for the customary visit to her natal home. Han Yu discovers that HXZ has practised Daoist cultivation the whole time; he is greatly enraged and a crisis ensues. HXZ is beaten and his teachers are expelled. HXZ is locked up in his study room at Wohushan.</p>	<p>Subject matter dealt with in chapters 3 (visit to natal home) and 4 (beating of HXZ and expulsion of teachers).</p>
Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>Zhang Qian and Li Wan tempt HXZ with liquor, wealth, lust, and temper (酒、财、色、气). HXZ preaches against these and flees from Wohushan</p>	<p>Chapter 5: Zhang Qian and Li Wan tempt HXZ with liquor, wealth, lust, and temper (酒、财、色、气). HXZ preaches against these and flees from Shuihushan</p>



by climbing over the wall (*guoqiang* 过墙). Symbolic interpretation of this phrase: escape from imprisonment by liquor, wealth, lust, and temper. On his way he undergoes several trials:

- 1) a frightening dream of King Yama under a willow tree manifested by Lan Caihe at the command of Zhongli Quan;
- 2) Zhongli Quan changes into an old man and Lü Dongbin into his beautiful daughter, who tempt HXZ to marry and stay with them.

Having passed both trials, Zhongli Quan and Lü Dongbin manifest their true form and take HXZ to Zhongnanshan 终南山 (esoteric explanation of the mountain's name).

by climbing over the wall. Trials of HXZ on his journey:

Chapter 6: Earth god produces inn with old man and beautiful maid, who try to make HXZ stay as son-in-law.

Chapter 7: HXZ threatened by tigers and demons; hears his masters slandered.

Chapter 8: Tempted by vision.



Back home, HXZ's escape has been discovered; Han Yu is angry, his wife and Lin Ying are distraught. Lin Ying's state of mind expressed in a <i>wugeng</i> 五更 song.	
Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
Emperor commands Han Yu, Lin Guo and Li Hedong to pray for snow at the Southern Altar; if they fail, their life is forfeit. Zhongli Quan & Lü Dongbin state that Han Yu used to be a divine general (<i>juanlianjiang</i> 卷帘将) who had been banished to the human world; previous attempts to deliver him were unsuccessful. They petition the Jade Emperor to induct HXZ as an immortal and	Chapter 9: HXZ inducted as an immortal, receives the title Kaiyuan yanfa da chanjiao jiaohua puji xian 开元演法大阐教化普济仙. Obtains magical instruments: Three golden writs, headdress, robe, fisher drum, clappers, flower basket.



have him deliver his uncle. Jade Emperor confers on HXZ the title Tianhua Zhenren Pudu Xianqing 天花真人普渡仙卿 and bestows on him various magical items (clappers, vajra, flower basket, gourd, flute).

HXZ sets out, meets two shepherds who recognize him as an immortal. So he chooses a better disguise and proceeds to the Southern Altar. There he forces courtesies from Han Yu (such as opening the central gate of the compound). He asks for three items to procure snow: a pig's head, rice, and liquor. He changes himself into a wolf that devours these three items, then changes back and through recitation of a mantra lets exactly three feet and

[Cf. phrasing:

HXBZ: 赐你降龙伏虎筒板一付, 上管三十三天, 中管人间生死, 下管一十八重地狱。

HXZQZ: 朕赐卿降三道金书, 上管三十三天, 中管人间善恶, 下管地府冥司。]

HXZ sets out, meets two shepherds who recognize him as an immortal. So he chooses a better disguise.

Chapter 12: HXZ prays for snow at Southern Altar. There he forces courtesies from Han Yu (such as opening the central gate of the compound). Ritual procedures much more involved, but similarly farcical. Result also three feet and three inches of snowfall.



three inches of snowfall. HXZ refuses payment and instead asks Han Yu to follow him and cultivate himself. Han Yu refuses, HXZ leaves.

HXZ turns his attention to his aunt and sends a mountain earth god to announce his arrival in a dream. Mrs. Du reports her dream to Lin Ying.

Chapter 11: HXZ sends dream to Mrs. Dou, who tells her adoptive son Han Qing 韩清 about it.

Chapter # in HXBZ

Narrative elements in HXBZ

Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ

Han Yu celebrates his 70th birthday. HXZ arrives and exchanges poems with Han Yu; HXZ preaches in poetic form about leaving worldly interests behind. Han Yu refuses angrily, HXZ leaves, but returns immediately for a second attempt. This time he magically produces two

Chapter 13: HXZ arrives at Han Yu's birthday feast and exchanges poems with Han Yu.





children from his fisher drum who perform a symbolic trick to admonish Han Yu (climbing stairs to sixth step only = Han Yu's present rank).

Scene switches to Mrs. Du. HXZ impersonates a Daoist who carries a letter from HXZ. Pretends that he lost the letter on the way, but can recite it from memory. Letter mentions Han Yu's adoptive son Zhang, who will surely revert to his original surname later. At Mrs. Du's request, HXZ delivers long song about filial piety beginning with the labours of pregnancy, then addressing the uncertainties of raising a child. He distinguishes true and false way of filial piety (真孝道/假孝道). Mrs. Du offers reward, but refuses to cultivate herself.

Chapter 11: HXZ impersonates a Daoist who carries a letter from HXZ to Mrs. Dou. Pretends that he lost the letter on the way, but can recite it from memory. He follows it up with a long sermon on impermanence.



Chapter # in HXBZ	
Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>HXZ visits Han Yu's birthday feast again. Presents a painting of a female immortal, who steps out of the picture to admonish Han Yu. HXZ performs trick with inexhaustible gourd and flower basket. Gourd contains a world of immortals. Basket made from celestial bamboo. HXZ orders Qingfeng 清风 and Mingyue 明月 to call forth a host of gods from the basket. HXZ makes prophecy about fate of Han Yu, then vanishes into thin air.</p> <p>Scene switches to Mrs. Du and Lin Ying. They talk about the miseries</p>	<p>Chapter 16: HXZ summons immortal maidens from a picture.</p> <p>Chapter 15: Trick of the inexhaustible gourd and flower basket.</p>





of childlessness. Mrs. Du recites a poem which Lin Ying takes as criticism of her barrenness; she replies with a poem that shifts the blame to HXZ. Lin Ying sends out her servants Chunxiang 春香 and Bitao 碧桃 to find a fortune-teller to cast her husband's fortune. HXZ arrives in disguise as fortune-teller. In the guise of fortune-telling, he tells her that there is no hope of HXZ returning and that she should leave the world as well.

Chapter 5: Criticism of childlessness with reference to hibiscus.

Chapter # in HXBZ

Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
<p>Having returned to Zhongnanshan, HXZ writes a letter to his aunt.</p> <p>The next day the birthday feast continues and</p>	<p>Chapter 14: HXZ vomits into a bowl; a dog devours the vomit and turns into a crane.</p>



HXZ comes visiting again, this time revealing his true identity. He presents peaches to his uncle; Han Yu throws one on the ground, where a yellow dog eats it and changes into a yellow crane.

Next he presents immortal wine to his uncle, as well as a landscape painting; Han Yu and HXZ enter the picture. They come to a narrow bridge to heaven, which can bestow different blessings to different people; Han Yu wishes for official promotion and steps on the bridge, but becomes afraid when he notices how high and narrow the bridge is. He starts calling out in fear, making HXZ afraid that the Jade Emperor might hear and so quickly sends Han Yu back to earth.

Chapter 18: HXZ presents magical peaches to the guests.

Chapter 17: Walkable landscape painting, but whole party enters instead of just Han Yu and HXZ. Han Yu's refusal to step on a narrow bridge ends the excursion.





<p>Scene switches to Lin Ying, who burns incense in the garden and prays to Heaven. HXZ takes the form of a Buddhist mendicant monk to admonish her.</p>	
<p>Chapter # in HXBZ</p>	
<p>Narrative elements in HXBZ</p>	<p>Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ</p>
<p>After deliberations at the celestial court the Jade Emperor commands HXZ to change his clappers into a Buddha bone; he himself and Lan Caihe should disguise themselves as foreign monks presenting the bone to the emperor. Han Yu criticizes the reception of the bone and is sentenced to death. HXZ influences the emperor to pardon Han Yu and banish him to Chaoyang 潮阳. He has 49 days to get there,</p>	<p>Chapter 18: Clappers are changed into the Buddha bone; Lan Caihe and HXZ take the shape of foreign monks. Death sentence of Han Yu.</p> <p>Chapter 19: Sentence commuted to banishment to Chaozhou. Han Yu has to arrive there within three months. Han Yu sets out with Zhang Qian and Li Wan.</p>



<p>otherwise he and his family will die. Han Yu quickly sets out, accompanied by Zhang Qian and Li Wan.</p> <p>Scene switches to Lin Ying, who has fallen ill with grief. HXZ comes to her disguised as physician. She takes his prescription, whereupon he reveals his true identity and admonishes her. She does not give in, but instead tries to tempt him sexually.</p>	
<p>Chapter # in HXBZ</p>	
<p>Narrative elements in HXBZ</p>	<p>Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ</p>
<p>Han Yu reaches Nanguanshan 南关山 amidst heavy snowfall sent by HXZ. There on a stele he and his servants discover the first lines of Han Yu's famous poem. Close by they encounter</p>	<p>Chapter 19: Episode of crossing river on a ferry boat (but not made of snow).</p> <p>Chapter 20: "Cold fish" exchange with fisherman. Discovery of the stele on which is inscribed the</p>





a fisher angling for “cold fish” (*hanyu* 寒鱼). Next the fisher produces a boat made from snow and offers to ferry Han Yu across the river; Han Yu and his servants distrust the immortal and his boat and refuse. Two tigers (Qingfeng & Mingyue) carry Li Wang and Zhang Qian off. Han Yu is left behind alone, cold and starving. HXZ manifests a straw hut, with some *mantou* on a table. Han Yu sings a *wugeng* song to give expression to his misery. Eventually he repents and is delivered by HXZ. He sends his uncle to Zhuoweishan 卓韦山; HXZ goes to Chaoyang disguised as his uncle and puts the public affairs there in order. He kills a monstrous fish

name of the place (Qinling Lantianguan 秦岭蓝田关).

Chapter 21: Zhang Qian and Li Wan carried off by tigers.

Han Yu stays in straw hut and eats *mantou* given by him to HXZ at his birthday feast. Writes his poem on wall.

Chapter 22: HXZ and Han Yu go to Chaozhou to put things in order and subdue the crocodile. Feigned death of Han Yu.

Chapter 23: HXZ sends Han Yu to Zhuoweishan.

Chapter 30: Han Yu returns to the ranks of the immortals.



(*shenyu* 神鱼) that demands sacrifices from the people of Chaoyang. Eventually he feigns the death of Han Yu, which is reported back to the capital. The emperor bestowed the posthumous name Wengong on him and gives honours and emoluments to Mrs. Du. HXZ takes Han Yu up to Heaven, where Han Yu refuses to be reinstated as *juanlianjiang*; instead he prefers to become earth god of Nanjing, where he will receive rich sacrifices (我爱南京都土地, 猪羊鸡酒用不完).

Chapter # in HXBZ

Narrative elements in HXBZ	Comparison with parallel narrative elements in HXZQZ
HXZ subjects Lin Ying to a trial and eventually has her delivered by Guanyin as	Chapter 29: Deliverance of Mrs. Dou and Lin Luying at Magu's 麻姑 hermitage.





one of her acolytes.

Next he turns his attention to his aunt, to whom he describes the horrors of the underworld. As a trial, he changes a stone lion into gold. Mrs. Du turns out to be still greedy for gold. Eventually, however she makes a vow to reform herself, is saved and sent to Nanjing to keep her husband company as *tudipo* 土地婆.

Chapter 11: The stone lion episode.

This synopsis allows a number of preliminary conclusions:

- 1) The overall storyline has remained the same, leading from Han Xiangzi's previous existence as a white crane, over his birth into the Han family and cultivation as an immortal to his deliverance through various trials of his family.
- 2) As a much shorter text, the *baojuan* version is obviously more compressed than the novel, lacking many episodes contained in the latter.
- 3) The sequence of several episodes is different.
- 4) The *baojuan* version contains a number of episodes not contained in the novel.



The latter two items are in my view the most significant and warrant further attention as they signal that the *baojuan* is not just a shorter version of the novel, but follows a narrative agenda of its own.

One effect of its different plot structure is to have women appear more regularly in the narrative. This begins in the first chapter with the karmic bond being created between Han Xiangzi and Lin Ying in their existence as crane and reed — a motif that is absent from the novel.⁴⁰ The only chapter without a significant role for the key female characters, Lin Ying and Mrs. Du, is chapter 11, which focuses on Han Yu's journey, conversion, and apotheosis — a narrative sequence that covers four and a half chapters in the novel. The other chapters pay equal or sometimes greater attention to Lin Ying and Mrs. Du; this is achieved by three techniques:

- 1) Female themes are dealt with in more detail in the *baojuan*. An example is Han Xiangzi's wedding, which takes up the whole of chapter 3 (out of twelve) in the *baojuan*, including the new motif of Lu Ban's intervention in manufacturing Lin Ying's lovingly described dowry suite. In the novel, the wedding is limited to about half of chapter 3 (out of thirty).
- 2) New episodes are created depicting Han Xiangzi's efforts to convert his aunt and his wife, such as his appearances as fortune-teller, Buddhist monk, and physician in chapters 8, 9, and 10 respectively.

40 The possible linkage of this theme with the novel's female protagonist's name, Luying ("reed flower"), awaits further investigation.

- 3) In the *baojuan*, such female-themed episodes are spliced into the narrative line of the novel. An example is the birthday feast sequence which in the novel covers four chapters (14-17) that focus primarily on Han Xiangzi's interactions with the male birthday guests; in the *baojuan*, Han Yu's birthday feast spreads over three chapters (7-9), but in each chapter is balanced by separate interactions between Han Xiangzi and his female relatives.

As a result the proportion of narrative matter dealing with female characters is higher in the *baojuan* than in the novel. A rough count of pages devoted to three main categories of subject matter in the *baojuan* and the novel makes this clear:

Theme	Percentage in HXBZ	Percentage in HXZQZ
HXZ as an individual (self-cultivation, relations with his masters etc.)	30%	26%
Han Yu and HXZ's interactions with him	37%	44%
female characters and HXZ's interactions with them	31%	25%
other subject matter	2%	5%

While in the novel episodes with parallels in the *baojuan* involving Han Xiangzi's female relatives occur mostly in separate, unconnected chapters (3, 5, 11, 17), the more balanced distribution of "female interest" episodes in the narrative structure of the *baojuan* makes this narrative emphasis even more prominent than the mere percentages imply.⁴¹

Conclusion

It is a well-known fact that narrative *baojuan* literature had (and was geared towards) a largely female audience. So it is not surprising per se to see a thematic shift towards Han Xiangzi's interactions with female characters.⁴² One purpose of this paper has been to test this general assumption concerning the nature of *baojuan* literature by examining the specific narrative techniques by means of which this thematic shift is achieved in the case of the *Han xian baozhuàn*. This is only a first step in a projected wider exploration of the Han Xiangzi theme

41 On the other hand, the novel has a lengthy thematic block concerning the harassment of Mrs. Dou and Lin Luying by unwelcome suitors, which is completely left out of the *baojuan*. This theme moves to the foreground in chapters 23-26 and boosts the percentage of female-centred elements in the novel stated above.

42 Wilt Idema argues intriguingly (and plausibly) that it was Ming-dynasty drama, including the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong shengxian ji*, that first gave the female characters greater visibility in the story. He argues that this was due to the need to create additional parts for the actors of female roles in the large theatrical troupes of the Ming period. Idema, "Narrative daoqing, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*," 120.

in Qing-period popular literature, which will seek a broader understanding of the interplay of genre conventions, audience expectations, cultural frames, and intertextual linkages. I plan to pursue this with regard to other Han Xiangzi texts, placing them wherever possible in their local cultural context.

However, even in the case of the *Han xian baozhuan*, this paper is merely a beginning. The text raises a number of questions that require further investigation. These include (but are not limited to):

- reasons for the neglect in the *baojuan* of a major female-centred thematic block in chapters 23 to 26 of the novel;
- other thematic shifts in the *baojuan* (such as the markedly more negative depiction of the Tang emperor Xianzong in the *baojuan*);⁴³
- a closer analysis of intertextual relationships between the HXBZ and the novel, as well as other works of popular literature (i.e., other *baojuan*, but also *daoqing*, *guci* etc.).⁴⁴

43 A new article by Bian Liangjun 卞良君 sketches the transformations of Han Yu's depictions in Qing period popular literature; see Bian, "Qing-dai daoqing, baojuan zhong Han Yu xingxiang de yanbian ji qi lishi wenhua jiazhi 清代道情、宝卷中韩愈形象的演变及其历史文化价值" *Zhongzhou xuekan* 中州学刊 2014, no. 2: 152-156. Rostislav Berezkin recently published an important article looking at the "role popular religious ideas played in the transformation of an image of a historical figure in Chinese vernacular literature." See Rostislav Berezkin, "The Transformation of Historical Material in Religious Storytelling: The Story of Huang Chao (d. 884) in the *Baojuan of Mulian Rescuing His Mother in Three Rebirths*," *Late Imperial China* 34, no. 2 (2013): 83-136.

44 Hu Hongbo, for example, detects *guci* 鼓词 features in the two Han Xiangzi *baojuan* he studied. See Hu Hongbo, "Qingmo Minchu xiuxiang guci baisanshi zhong zonglun 清末民初绣像鼓词百卅种综论," *Chengda zhongwen xuebao* 成大中文学报 11 (2003): 228. Wilt Idema has provided us with a study and synopsis of an important *daoqing* in 22 *hui* 回, the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben* 韩湘子九度文公道情全本. Idema, "Narrative *daoqing*, the Legend of Han Xiangzi, and the Good Life in the *Han Xiangzi jiudu Wengong daoqing quanben*," 93-150. Increasing attention has been paid by Chinese scholars in recent years to the close relationship between and increasing intermixture of the genres of *baojuan* and *daoqing* in the late Qing. See, for example, Wang Dingyong 王定勇, "Baojuan yu daoqing guanxi lunlüe 宝卷与道情关系论略," *Wenhua yichan* 文化遗产 2015, no. 4: 123-131. Several studies have been made of the overlap between these text and performance genres in the local context of Yongji (Shanxi province). See, for example, Yang Yongbing 杨永兵, "Shanxi Yongji daoqing baojuan yuanyuan chutan 山西永济道情宝卷渊源初探," *Dawutai* 大舞台 2012, no. 11: 270-271; Yang Yongbing, "Shanxi Yongji daoqing baojuan wenben yanjiu chutan 山西永济道情宝卷文本研究初探," *Zhongguo yinyue* 中国音乐 2012, no. 3: 116-119; Zhang Xuejiao 张雪娇, Zhang Lu 张露, Liu Fengjiao 刘凤娇, "Shanxi Yongji daoqing yiren xuanchang baojuan yanjiu 山西永济道情艺人宣唱宝卷研究," *Wenxue yanjiu* 文学研究 2016, no. 4: 42-44; Shang Lixin 尚丽新 & Yuan Ye 袁野, "Shanxi Yongji baojuan yu Hedong baojuan 山西永济与河东宝卷," *Wenhua yichan* 文化遗产 2015, no. 4: 132-138.